

Development and Evaluation of the Integrity of the Diniyah National Curriculum: Analysis of the Parallel Integration Model in Pesantren

Siti Sahra^{1*}, Sabarudin², Muh Gaki Firman³

¹Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University Yogyakarta, Indonesia

²Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University Yogyakarta, Indonesia

³Al-Azhar University Egypt

E-mail: 24204012041@student.uin-suka.ac.id¹ sabarudin@uin-suka.ac.id²
firmanaky@gmail.com³

Received: 20/01/2026

Revised: 10/03/2026

Accepted: 31/03/2026



© 2026 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC-BY-SA) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>).

Abstract: *This study analyzes the development of the integration of the national curriculum and the diniyah curriculum (Islam) and evaluates the quality of its implementation in the Pesantren Alkhairaat in Central Palu. Using a qualitative case study design, data was collected through field observation and in-depth interviews with 4 ustadz and 6 students who were selected purposively. Data analysis was carried out using the interactive model Miles, Huberman, and Saldana, including data condensation, presentation, and conclusion drawing and verification. The results of the study show that curriculum integration develops gradually and is currently implemented through a parallel model, with general learning in the morning and early learning in the afternoon to evening. The effectiveness of the implementation reached around 80%, despite facing limited facilities, tight schedules, and student adaptation to the two curriculum systems. Curriculum integration is still at the structural stage, but it has the potential to lead to substantial integration through strengthening integrative pedagogy, improving teacher competence, and facility support. These findings imply the need for cross-disciplinary teacher training, collaboration in integrated curriculum design, and investment in educational facilities. The research was limited to one case study; The next research is recommended to conduct a comparative study across pesantren to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the curriculum integration model in Indonesia.*

Keywords: *curriculum integration; pesantren; curriculum; Islamic Education; parallel integration model; Quality of Learning.*

Introduction

In the era of globalization and the development of science, the relationship between religious education and general education has become an important debate in contemporary educational discourse (Ergeshov, 2025). A secular approach that separates the two has long dominated modern education systems, especially in Europe and North America (Wright, 2018). This paradigm departs from the assumption that education must be religiously neutral to accommodate a pluralistic society (Milerski, 2023). However, recent studies have shown that the integration

between religious and academic dimensions is actually able to produce more holistic, meaningful, and sustainable learning (Jackson, 2022).

A number of studies reinforce the importance of this integrative approach. Baumfield et.al,(2023) It shows that the integration of religious and national curricula does not lead to fragmentation of knowledge, but rather produces graduates who have academic competence as well as a strong religious identity. These findings are reinforced by Manaf et al., (2025) and Drake (2020) which affirms that the integrated curriculum contributes to the development of critical thinking skills and competencies for the 21st century. In addition, Horwitz, (2021) Through his meta-analysis, it was found that there was a positive correlation between integrated religious education and the academic and social-emotional development of students.

In the Indonesian context, the integration of the national curriculum and early childhood education develops within the framework of institutional transformation of pesantren that continue to adapt to the demands of the times (Latifah, 2024). Pesantren not only maintain their traditional function as a center for the transmission of Islamic knowledge, but also make adjustments to the modern education system ((Astuti et.al, 2023). This transformation is strengthened through government policies, such as the Regulation of the Minister of Religion Number 18 of 2019, which encourages the integration of the education system in the pesantren environment (Hakim et al., 2024). However, the implementation of the policy still faces various challenges, especially in the aspects of institutions, resources, and learning management (Muhtadin, 2022).(Mustofa, 2024)

The Pesantren Alkhairaat was chosen as the research context because it has historical and institutional characteristics that are typical of this research question. Since its establishment in 1928 by Habib Idrus bin Salim Aljufri, this institution has been one of the pioneers in adopting the national curriculum since 1954(Abu Anwar, 2020). In addition, its existence in Eastern Indonesia provides a different perspective from previous research that focused more on Islamic boarding schools on the island of Java (Ahmad Budiyo, 2021). Furthermore, the scale and institutional complexity of Alkhairaat make it an important representation to understand the practice of curriculum integration in pesantren that have matured institutionally.

A number of previous studies have examined the integration of curriculum in Islamic education from various perspectives. Ziyah, (2023) emphasizing the importance of integration in avoiding the dichotomy of knowledge, while Malik et al. (2025) more highlighting its impact on the readiness of graduates to face global challenges. Mustam et al., (2025) examine integration in the context of education policy, while Noer et al., (2025) highlighting the various implementation challenges at the institutional level. However, most of these studies still focus on conceptual, policy, or general impact aspects, and have not specifically examined how structural or parallel integration models are implemented in the daily institutional practices of pesantren (Mulyani, 2026).

Therefore, this study aims to analyze the development and history and implementation of the integration of the national curriculum and the early integration of the Pesantren Alkhairat Central Palu, secondly evaluate the quality of the implementation of the parallel integration model in the learning process, and identify challenges and opportunities for development towards the integration of the gap between conceptual studies and implementive practices in the literature of Islamic education in Indonesia.

Method

This study uses a qualitative approach with a case study design to examine in depth the practice of integrating the national curriculum and early childhood at the Pesantren Alkhairaat in the central Palu (Dimas 2023). The case study approach was chosen because this research aims to understand complex contemporary phenomena in real institutional contexts, where the boundaries between phenomena and their contexts cannot be explicitly separated (Robert K.Yin, 2015). This approach allows for an in-depth exploration of the experience of education actors in managing and implementing curriculum integration (Creswell, 2018).

The research was carried out at the Pesantren Alkhairaat in Palu Center, Palu City, Central Sulawesi. The selection of the location was based on three considerations: the institution's long experience in integrating the national curriculum and early childhood education, its position as a representation of large Pesantren outside Java, and adequate data accessibility for case study purposes

The research participants consisted of 4 ustadz and 6 students who were directly involved in the learning process. Participant selection is carried out purposively with a maximum variation strategy to obtain a diversity of perspectives (Nicholas, 1989). The criteria for ustadz include: (1) having at least two years of teaching experience in the pesantren environment, and (2) being involved in teaching in the national curriculum and early childhood. Meanwhile, students are selected based on the variation of grade level and learning experience in an integrated curriculum system.

Data collection is carried out through two main techniques. First, passive participant observation which is focused on learning practices, schedule setting, and dynamics of curriculum implementation in daily activities (Ramos, 2024). Second An in-depth semi-structured interview was conducted to explore the experiences, perceptions, and strategies of the ustadz and students in managing two curriculum systems simultaneously. Interviews using guidelines developed based on five research focuses (Wingate 2024), as presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Research Interview Instruments

Yes	Research Focus	Indicator	Interview Questions	Inf.
1	Development of Curriculum Integration	Initial integration process	How was the beginning of the integration of the national curriculum and early childhood applied in this pesantren?	U
2	Curriculum Implementation	Implementation and time allocation	How is the implementation and time division of the two curriculums in daily activities?	U
3	Management Strategy	Curriculum management and balance	How does ustadz manage and balance the two curricula simultaneously?	U

Yes	Research Focus	Indicator	Interview Questions	Inf.
4	Quality of Implementation	Implementation effectiveness	To what extent is curriculum integration effective in the learning process?	U
5	Implementation Challenges	Obstacles in implementation	What are the main obstacles faced in integrating the two curriculum systems?	U/S
6	Solutions and Innovation	Development efforts	How are efforts being made to overcome obstacles and improve the quality of integration?	U/S

Description: U = Ustadz; S = Santri

Data analysis was carried out interactively following the model Matthew B.Miles, A. Michael Huberman,(2014) and which consists of three stages: (1) data condensation, namely the process of selection, focusing, simplification, abstraction, and transformation of raw data; (2) the presentation of data in the form of descriptive narratives and findings matrices; and (3) continuous drawing of conclusions and verification during the analysis process. The validity of the data is guaranteed through triangulation of sources (ustadz and students) and triangulation of methods (interviews and observations), as well as re-checking participants (member check) to increase the credibility of findings (Dahal, 2025).

Results

This section presents research findings obtained from in-depth interviews and participant observations on curriculum integration practices at Pesantren Alkhairaat. The findings are organized into three main themes: (1) the development of curriculum integration, (2) the implementation of the parallel integration model, and (3) implementation challenges.

1. Development of Curriculum Integration

The integration of the national curriculum and early education at the Pesantren Alkhairaat developed gradually along with the institutional transformation of the pesantren. At first, the pesantren only functioned as a place of residence for students who studied outside the pesantren. After the establishment of formal schools in the pesantren environment, general and early learning began to be implemented simultaneously. All students are required to follow both education systems, while national policies encourage integration without eliminating the essence of early learning.

One of the ustadz explained: "Initially, the pesantren only functioned as a dormitory for students who went to school outside. After the school is established in the pesantren, public and religious lessons then run together." (U1). This is reinforced by the statement of another ustadz who emphasized that national policy is the main driver: "Schools must follow the national curriculum, but pesantren still maintain early learning as their identity." (U2). As the development progresses, the curriculum

begins to be directed to accommodate the interests and talents of students through various extracurricular activities.

2. Implementation of Parallel Integration Model

The implementation of curriculum integration at the Pesantren Alkhairaat is carried out through a parallel model, namely a clear time separation between the two curriculum systems. General education is carried out in the morning, while early learning takes place in the afternoon until evening. Observations show that this schedule is carried out consistently and structured.

Based on the results of observations, the effectiveness of integration implementation is estimated to only reach around 80%. One of the ustadz stated: "All activities have been running, but in practice they have not been maximized, around 80% have been running." (U2). Nevertheless, the balance between the two systems is well maintained: "We ensure that public and religious lessons go hand in hand and do not interfere with each other." (U4). In addition to the main lessons, extracurricular activities on Sundays provide opportunities for students to develop their academic and non-academic potential.

3. Implementation Challenges

The implementation of parallel integration faces a number of interrelated challenges. In terms of facilities, the limitations of learning technology are a significant obstacle, so that conventional methods still dominate the learning process in the classroom. In terms of time management, the density of schedules from morning to night caused some students to experience fatigue, even though they were still enthusiastic and motivated.

Students are also faced with the challenge of adapting to two learning systems that are different in content and approach. S5 students stated: "You have to learn general and religious lessons at the same time, the way of learning is also different." However, interaction between students in the classroom and in the dormitory has been proven to help the adaptation process: "If you don't understand, usually ask a friend." (S6). These findings are presented in full in Table 2.

Table 2. Research Findings Matrix: Curriculum Integration in Pesantren Alkhairaat

Yes	Tema Utama	Sub-Theme	Interview Quotes	They report	Observational Findings
1	Curriculum Development	History of integration	"Initially, the pesantren was only a dormitory... After the school was established, general and religious lessons were applied together."	U1	All students follow the national curriculum and early childhood in one structured environment.
2	Curriculum Development	National policies	"Schools must follow the national curriculum, but	U2	The national curriculum is running; Diniyah's

Yes	Tema Utama	Sub-Theme	Interview Quotes	They report	Observational Findings
			pesantren still maintain diniyah."		activities continue to run intensively.
3	Curriculum Development	Students' interests and talents	"In the future, students will be directed according to their interests and talents."	U3	Extracurricular programs support the development of academic and non-academic potential.
4	Curriculum Implementation	Time division	"General lessons in the morning, early in the afternoon until evening."	U1	Structured daily schedule: morning for the public, afternoon-night for early morning.
5	Curriculum Implementation	Educational balance	"We make sure that general and religious lessons go hand in hand."	U4	Activities run balanced; The material does not overlap with each other.
6	Curriculum Implementation	Implementation effectiveness	"In practice, it is not optimal, about 80% is running."	U2	The integration runs mostly, but it's not 100% optimal.
7	Curriculum Implementation	Extracurricular activities	"Sundays are used for extracurricular activities."	U3	Students actively participate in sports, art, debate, and social activities.
8	Challenge	Facility limitations	"Technology facilities are still limited."	U4	Dominance of conventional methods; limited classrooms.
9	Challenge	Study load	"Activities are quite dense... sometimes I feel tired."	S1	Students undergo an intense schedule from morning to night.

Yes	Tema Utama	Sub-Theme	Interview Quotes	They report	Observational Findings
10	Challenge	Learning motivation	"Sometimes it's tired, but we get a lot of knowledge."	S3	The students remained enthusiastic because of the support of friends and teachers.
11	Challenge	Adaptation of two systems	"You have to learn general and religion at the same time."	S5	Students adjust their learning methods; Group discussions are utilized.
12	Challenge	Interaction between students	"If you don't understand, usually ask a friend."	S6	Active collaboration supports the understanding of religious and general materials.
13	Character Development	Character & social values	"Extracurriculars help us learn to appreciate friends and work together."	All S	Extracurricular activities form tolerance, care, and communication.
14	Teacher Effectiveness	Teaching strategies	"We try to balance general and religious lessons so that all students can understand both."	All U	The teacher adjusts the method; The limited number and learning resources are a challenge.

Description: U = Ustadz; S = Santri

Discussion

1. Parallel Integration Model in Pesantren Alkhairaat and Theoretical Perspectives

The findings of the study confirm that the curriculum integration model at the Pesantren Alkhairaat is parallel, where the national curriculum and early learning run in one institution, but are separated in terms of content and time allocation. Within the framework of curriculum integration typology, this model falls into the category of structural integration, which is a form of integration that regulates the relationship between two curriculum systems at the organizational and schedule management levels, not at the level of unifying learning content (Mikko, 2021).

The distinction between structural, thematic, and substantial integrations becomes relevant to position these findings theoretically (Bazeley, 2024). Structural integration regulates time and institutions; thematic integration connects materials between curricula thematically; while substantial integration brings together content, pedagogical approaches, and evaluation systems as a whole (Malmen, 2023). The findings in Alkhairaat show that this pesantren is at the stage of structural integration and is in the process of moving towards deeper integration, as reflected in efforts to develop programs based on the interests and talents of students.

2. Comparison with Integration Models in Other Pesantren

Compared to other Pesantren in Indonesia, the Alkhairaat integration model has a distinctive character while showing a general contextual pattern. At MA Walisongo Situbondo, integration is carried out through a thematic learning model (webbed), where the national curriculum and religious materials are linked in one integrated thematic framework (Mirzat, 2025). Meanwhile, the Pesantren Ar-Raudlatul Hasanah in Medan implements a more balanced integration model with a reduction in the separation between the two curricula (Yunan, 2021). This difference indicates that the choice of integration model in pesantren is greatly influenced by the institutional capacity, teacher resources, and socio-historical context of each institution (Arroisi, 2024).

In a broader context, the parallel integration model in Alkhairaat can also be compared to formal Islamic education practices in other countries. In contrast to Islamic schools in Malaysia or Egypt which tend to integrate religious material into general subjects in a more systematic manner (Scott, 2025). Indonesian Pesantren such as Alkhairaat maintain a structural separation between the two curriculum systems. This reflects the uniqueness of the tradition of pesantren as an institution that simultaneously maintains the identity of classical Islamic science and meets the demands of the modern national education system (Muttaqin, 2025).

3. Factors Supporting and Inhibiting Integration

The analysis of the findings identified several factors that affect the quality of curriculum integration implementation. In terms of support, strong institutional commitment, national policy support (Permenag No. 18 of 2019)(Anggraini, 2025), the culture of collaboration between students, and the existence of extracurricular programs contribute positively to the success of the parallel model. Interaction between students in the dormitory has proven to be an effective source of informal learning, especially in helping to adapt to two curriculum systems at once.

In terms of barriers, the limitation of learning technology facilities, the density of learning schedules, and the limited number of teachers who have cross-curricular competencies are the main obstacles. This condition is consistent with the findings Wardi, (2025) and Hamdani, (2025) which identifies limited human resources and infrastructure as a common obstacle in the implementation of curriculum integration in Indonesian Indonesian pesantren. The effectiveness of the implementation that has only reached 80% shows that there is still significant room for improvement.

Sec. 4. Opportunities Towards Substantial Integration

Although it is currently in the stage of structural integration, the research findings identify a number of real opportunities for the Indonesian Pesantren Alkhairaat to develop towards substantial integration. First, the interest and talent development program that is being designed opens up opportunities to build thematic bridges

between general academic competencies and Islamic values. Second, the culture of discussion and collaboration between students that has been built can be used as a basis for developing project-based learning that integrates science and religious perspectives.

Third, the development of educational technology can help overcome the limitations of facilities and optimize learning time management. Fourth, systematic cross-disciplinary teacher training can improve the ability of ustadz to identify thematic points that connect the national curriculum with early learning. These findings are in line with recommendations Qomar, (2024) that the transformation of the integration of the pesantren curriculum needs to be carried out in stages by considering the readiness of institutions and human resources.

Conclusion

This study concludes that the integration of early childhood and the national curriculum at the Indonesian Pesantren Alkhairaat in Central Palu has only reached the stage of structural integration, where the national curriculum and early learning run in parallel in one institution with a clear division of time. This model is able to maintain a balance between the formation of religious character and the academic competence of students, even though its effectiveness has only reached around 80% and faces challenges such as limited facilities, schedule density, and the need for students' adaptation to the two learning systems.

In practical terms, these findings imply the need for the Ministry of Religion and pesantren managers to develop cross-disciplinary teacher training, design a balanced integrated curriculum, and improve educational technology facilities to support more effective integration. However, this study was limited to one case study. Further research is expected to compare this model with other pesantren in various regions using a quantitative approach to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the integration of pesantren curriculum in Indonesia.

References

- [1] Ahmad Budiyo. (2021). The Concept of an Integrated Curriculum. *Imuna*, 3, 1.
- [2] Anggraini. (2025). Integration Management of the National Curriculum and Cambridge Curriculum in Improving the Quality of Education. *Encyclopedia: Saburai Journal of Learning Education and Innovation*, 05(02), 295–307.
- [3] Arroisi, J. (2024). Coping the discrepancy between moral and intellectual achievement: the model integration of higher education and modern Islamic boarding schools in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 14(2), 231–257. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v14i2.231-257>
- [4] Astuti et.al. (2023). Optimizing the Role of Islamic Boarding Schools in Islamic Education. *Journal of General Studies and Research*, 1(3).
- [5] Baumfield et.al. (2023). Research characteristics of professional learning across professions: A mapping review. *Rewiring Of Education*, 11(2). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/rev3.3395> <https://doi.org/10.1002/rev3.3395> Pengidentifikasi Digital Objects (DOI)
- [6] Bazeley, P. (2024). Conceptualizing Integration in Mixed Methods Research. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 18(3), 225–234. <https://doi.org/10.1177/15586898241253636>
- [7] Creswell. (2018). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitatif, and Mixed Methods*.

- [8] Dahal, N. (2025). Qualitative data analysis : reflections , procedures , and some points for consideration. *Frontiers InResearchMetrics AndAnalytics*, 30(9).
- [9] Dimas Assyakurrohim), Dewa Ikhrum), Rusdy A Sirodj), M. W. A. (2023). Case Study Methods in Qualitative Research. *Journal of Science and Computer Education, March*. <https://doi.org/10.47709/jpsk.v3i01.1951>
- [10] Drake, S. M., & Reid, J. L. (2020). 21st Century Competencies in Light of the History of Integrated Curriculum. *Frontiers in Education*, 5(July), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2020.00122>
- [11] Ergeshov, E. (2025). Legal and Ethical Aspects of Teaching Religion in Schools. *Pharos Journal of Theology ISSN*, 106(3), 1–14.
- [12] Fitriani, A. (2025). A Comprative Analysis Of Contemporary Islamic Education Systems : Philosophical, Sociological, And Pedagogical Perspectives, From Indonesia, Malaysia, And Egypt. *Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 11(1).
- [13] Hakim, I. R., Unnajjah, L. S., & Rahman, A. S. (2024). Adaptive Strategies of Madrasah in Implementing The National Curriculum and Madrasah Operational Curriculum. *Edukasi: The Journal of Educational Research*, 04(03).
- [14] Hamdani, U. L. (2025). Evaluation of management and curriculum problems for the mutualization of education in salafiyah Islamic boarding schools. *Performance: Journal of Islamic Education Management*, 3(1), 16–36.
- [15] Horwitz, I. M. (2021). Religion and Academic Achievement: A Review of Research Covering High School and College. *Journal of Religious Research*, 1(3).
- [16] Jackson. (2022). *An International List of Educational Periodicals*.
- [17] Latifah. (2024). The History of Islamic Education in Indonesia. *HISTORICAL: Journal of History and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 138–153.
- [18] Malik et al. (2025). The Challenges of Developing Islamic Education Curriculum and Strategies for Its Development in Facing Future Competency Demands. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 6(1), 111–126.
- [19] Malmen, E. P. (2023). Its effects on student argumentative written productions. *International Association for Research in L1-Education*, 2023, 1–28.
- [20] Manaf, S., Darajat, M. H., Hur, M., Zh, R., Zufar, Z., Thaariq, A., Syam, A. R., & Jamil, H. A. (2025). Strategic Integration of General and Religious Education in Indonesian Pesantren : Building Holistic Character for National Resilience . *Edcomtech: Journal of Educational Technology Studies*, 10(2), 133–146.
- [21] Matthew B.Miles, A. Michael Huberman, J. S. (2014). *Qaulitative Data Analysis*.
- [22] Mikko. (2021). Going beyond the boundaries of the curriculum to gain in-depth knowledge. *The Curriculum Journal*, 32(2). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/curj.77>
- [23] Milerski, B., & Zieliński, T. J. (2023). Religion in a world-view neutral school . Challenges on the example of Poland. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 45(3), 288–300. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2022.2049208>
- [24] Mirzat, K. (2025). Teacher Strategies in Character Formation to Enhance Students ' Social Attitudes at Madrasah. *Attadrib: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 8(3), 598–607.
- [25] Muhammad Akhsanul Muhtadin, T. A. L. (2022). Integration of the National Education Curriculum and the Islamic Boarding School Curriculum. *Journal of Reform*, 11, 2.
- [26] Mulyani. (2026). Strategies for the Transformation of Traditional Islamic Boarding Schools in Aceh Singkil : Integrating Education , Social , and Religious Aspects. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 7(1), 80–94.
- [27] Mustam, A., Ramli, N., & Zainuddin, M. (2025). Integration-Interconnective : An Implementation of the Unification of Islamic and General Education Policies. *Journal of Economics, Finance and Management Studies*, 0(04), 2010–2016. <https://doi.org/10.47191/jefms/v8>

-
- [28] Mustofa, I. (2024). Systematic Review : Meta-Synthesis of Implementation of Act No . 18 of 2019 on Pesantren. *Educan Journal of Islamic Education*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.21111/educan.v8i1.11548>
- [29] Muttaqin, A. I. (2025). Institutional Adaptation of Islamic Boarding Schools in Indonesia : Balancing Tradition and Modern Education. *Al-Tanzim: Journal of Islamic Education Management Vol.*, 09(03), 1016–1029.
- [30] Nicholas. (1989). Quality Variations and Maximal Variety Differentiation. *Regional Science and Urban Economics*, 19, 21–29.
- [31] Noer, S. T., Laila, F., Mufarokah, A., Anwar, H. S., & Mudhofar, A. (2025). Curriculum Changes in Indonesia ; Implementation and its Challenges in Religious Institutions. *Journal of Education Research and Practice (JERP)*, 3(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.70376/jerp.Received>
- [32] Qomar, M. (2024). Integration of School Curriculum and Islamic Boarding Schools in Preparing the Golden Generation with holistic intelligence. *SHS Web of Conferences*, 03001.
- [33] Ramos, R. B., & Anonuevo, A. B. (2024). School Heads ' Experiences on the Conduct of Classroom Observation. *Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies Volume*, 50(9), 167–186.
- [34] Robert K.Yin. (2015). *Case Study Research Design and Metode*.
- [35] Wardi, M. (2025). Evaluation of the Islamic Education Curriculum in Islamic Boarding Schools : Assessing the Impact on the Quality of Learning and Curriculum Management. *Journal Evaluation in Education (JEE)*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.37251/jee.v6i2.1455>
- [36] Wingate, T. G., & Bourdage, J. S. (2024). What are interviews for ? A qualitative study of employment interview goals and design. *OR IG INA L AR TI CLE What*, 555–580. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrm.22215>
- [37] Wiwi Hadi Sumitro, Abu Anwar, H. (2020). Integration of Religious and Secular Values in Islamic Boarding Schools, Madrasah and Islamic Schools in Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Civilization*, 2(2), 98–107.
- [38] Wright. (2018). Improving Islamic religious education pedagogy through the application of critical religious education, variation theory, and learning study models. *British Journal of Religious Education*, 18(7). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2018.1484695>
- [39] Yunan, M. (2021). International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding Application Values of Character Education in the Modern Pesantren System and Culture (Study at Pondok Pesantren Modern Ar-Raudlatul Hasanah Medan). *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 8(12), 295–307.
- [40] Ziyah. (2023). The Influence Of Science Dichotomy On Islamic Religious Education Curriculum. *Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Studies*, 1(1), 7–14.